# R.B. Botagarin<sup>1</sup>, K.S. Musin<sup>2</sup>

Received: 08 April 2025 | Accepted: 20 May 2025

<sup>1,2</sup>Karaganda Buketov University, Karaganda, Kazakhstan (E-mail: botagarin\_ruslan@mail.ru, mkuat80@mail.ru)

<sup>1</sup>ORCID ID: 0000-0002-9633-8182, <sup>1</sup>Scopus autor ID: 57193385138

<sup>2</sup>ORCID ID:0000-0002-6008-1303, <sup>2</sup> Scopus autor ID:57194525796

# Legal foundations of cooperation between the Republic of Kazakhstan and foreign states in the military sphere: issues military policy and service

This article examines the current state of cooperation between the Republic of Kazakhstan and various foreign nations in the military domain. According to the authors, in recent years, amid global military-political instability, the primary condition for mitigating adverse consequences is the continued collaboration in the military sector. The study analyzes measures taken to ensure military security, as well as the distinctive features of military activity directions. The objective of this research is to explore the legal foundations of the Republic of Kazakhstan's military cooperation with international organizations, the Republic of Turkey, and the Russian Federation. During the research, a legal analysis of agreements in the military domain was conducted, and comparative-legal methods were applied. The research is grounded in a range of normative sources, including the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the country's military doctrines, agreements on military cooperation with the Republic of Turkey, military cooperation plans, and various other legal instruments that govern military collaboration. The authors conclude that the establishment of military cooperation with neighboring countries to ensure peaceful coexistence is one of the most crucial functions of any state in guaranteeing military security.

Keywords: Republic of Kazakhstan, Republic of Turkey, military security, Constitution, military doctrine, military policy, military service, agreement, cooperation, legal framework.

#### Introduction

Following the collapse of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics, a superpower that had endured for 70 years, the Republic of Kazakhstan emerged as an independent sovereign state, granting it the freedom to shape its own governance and policies. For any young state, which had for a long time operated within a system where decisions were made by a central authority, starting a new in a radically different environment and taking bold steps to define the future of the country was undoubtedly a challenging task.

Since gaining independence in 1991, the Republic of Kazakhstan, having full sovereignty over its territory, like other newly independent states, acquired the right to independently conduct its domestic and foreign policies [1]. In this context, Kazakhstan, adhering to the norms and principles of international law, enshrined as key tenets a policy of fostering mutual cooperation and friendly relations with neighboring countries, peaceful settlement of disputes, and the renunciation of the first use of armed force [2]. In other words, it is clear that the state opposes the use of military force as a primary response in the event of any conflict. In the current global environment, the mere presence of military formations and military-technological capabilities is insufficient for ensuring national security. A state's security is primarily and directly linked to the policy it pursues, the political resolve of its leadership, and the presence of mutual assistance, cooperation, and concluded agreements.

Later military doctrines of the Republic of Kazakhstan emphasize the creation of an international relations framework that progressively reduces the reliance on military force. These doctrines assert that conflicts between nations and peoples should be resolved primarily through political, diplomatic, legal, economic, informational, and other peaceful means, rather than military action. The fundamental goals for ensuring national security in the military sphere include pursuing policies that promote cooperation and friendly relations with neighboring countries, bolstering the nation's military structure, respecting the sovereignty of other states by avoiding interference in their internal matters, and proactively preventing any military threats to the Republic [3].

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. E-mail: botagarin ruslan@mail.ru

In this context, Kazakhstan pursues international military cooperation on two fronts: globally, through its engagement with the United Nations, and regionally, within military-political frameworks such as the Collective Security Treaty Organization (CSTO) of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO), the Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia (CICA), and the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). Additionally, Kazakhstan has forged bilateral agreements with several foreign nations, focusing on military cooperation, mutual support, and fostering friendly relations.

The aim of this research is to conduct a comprehensive legal analysis of the foundational framework for the Republic of Kazakhstan's international military cooperation. This includes examining the legal regulation of such cooperation, as well as assessing the effectiveness of the measures undertaken within the scope of military collaboration to ensure national security.

Research objectives:

- -To analyze the development of military cooperation between the Republic of Kazakhstan and other countries;
- -To examine the legal and regulatory framework governing international cooperation in the military sphere;
  - -To explore the specific features of activities in the field of international military cooperation.

The research methodology is rooted in the analysis of international legal documents, agreements, and priorities enshrined in national legislation that pertain to military cooperation. Furthermore, the research examines the methods of their implementation.

In academic literature, there is no unified or universally accepted perspective on the issue of international cooperation among states in the military sphere. Some scholars argue that, when establishing such cooperation, states should focus on developing in-depth relationships in specific areas of military security. Others, however, contend that each state selects an expanded format for cooperation based on its own foreign policy.

Given the regional significance of the Republic of Kazakhstan, its military security policy should place special emphasis on the development of comprehensive, multidimensional, and multifaceted cooperation in areas such as defense, mutual military assistance, professional development, and the formation of a strong military force. First, this approach ensures security. Second, the presence of a jointly developed military, founded on mutual trust, strengthens the country's defense capabilities. Third, it guarantees social and legal protection for military personnel. These processes should be carried out on the basis of mutually agreed decisions between states and international organizations, rooted in shared interests. The agreements reached must be enshrined in national legislation and implemented through the appropriate mechanisms.

International cooperation in the military sphere is governed by both international and national legal norms, giving it a multifaceted nature. Despite the contributions of domestic and foreign scholars, such as M.V. Danilovich, O.P. Chazov, A.F. Klimenko, O.N. Zenchukova and V.M. Kulagin, their works do not address the issue comprehensively. Instead, they focus on isolated aspects of the problem.

Throughout the study, the authors aim to identify the specific features by analyzing key aspects of Kazakhstan's military cooperation with Turkey and Russia — countries with which Kazakhstan has recently established close military ties. This is accomplished through a comparative legal analysis of the military strategies of these countries, emphasizing the innovative aspects and significance of the research. By examining the directions of military activity in this context, the study underscores its relevance and contribution to the field. The ongoing research fills in the gaps in legal science, as it is complex in nature.

## Methods and materials

A thorough examination of the Republic of Kazakhstan's international military-political cooperation was carried out using a combination of comparative-legal, formal-legal, and historical analytical methods. These approaches were applied to scrutinize international military agreements and legal frameworks associated with international organizations. Specifically, the analysis involved reviewing key documents such as the Constitution and Declaration of Independence of Kazakhstan, laws pertaining to military security, international treaties with countries like the USA, Russia, and Turkey, as well as the Military Doctrine of Kazakhstan. The analytical method was employed to assess these texts, while the historical and comparative-legal methods were used to explore the legal dimensions of Kazakhstan's international military partnerships. This approach allowed for an examination of the goals, tasks, and primary areas of activity of international organizations that Kazakhstan has joined since gaining independence. The formal-legal method enabled the

identification of the distinctive features of Kazakhstan's Armed Forces and allowed for an analysis of the regulatory and legal framework of Kazakhstan's international military cooperation.

Furthermore, during the research, laws concerning military policy and key directions of the country's military activity were analyzed, along with agreements, acts from international organizations, and scholarly works from both domestic and foreign researchers.

#### Results

The examination of international treaties and domestic legal norms revealed that military cooperation evolves based on international agreements that are firmly established within the legal framework. These agreements are directly linked to the stability of a state's military policy, aimed at ensuring its national security. In this context, the implementation of each cooperation agreement into the national legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan determines the future trajectory of such cooperation.

Summarizing the tasks within the realm of military cooperation, the analysis indicates that without addressing the issues of mutual legal regulation, it is impossible to ensure the effective collaborative functioning of the parties at the legislative level. In our view, such coordination can only be achieved through systematic joint efforts by states in developing national legislation, taking into account the obligations enshrined in cooperation agreements.

Considering contemporary realities, geopolitical factors, the international environment, as well as national mentality and traditions, the Republic of Kazakhstan is shaping its own system of military cooperation with foreign countries. In the field of international military cooperation, key issues for the Republic of Kazakhstan, in the context of its national interests, include the development of negotiations aimed at strengthening regional security, enhancing measures of mutual trust, joint training of military personnel, and establishing military training levels across various areas. Additionally, coordinated monitoring of the military situation, joint scientific research, the social and legal protection of military personnel, and other areas of collaborative activity are also key priorities.

To comprehensively regulate the aforementioned issues, it is essential to have an intergovernmental document in the form of a mutually agreed decision. The current Concept of Military Cooperation among the member states of the Commonwealth of Independent States, adopted in 2020, is effective until 2025. This year marks the expiration of its term. However, in our view, it is crucial for the states to adopt a similar document that takes into account the new, critical military threats facing the world.

Furthermore, the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which serves as the legal foundation for military cooperation, outlines various areas of activity within the realm of military policy.

However, it lacks a clear and detailed definition of the concept of military cooperation itself. In our view, in order to avoid discrepancies in intergovernmental relations regarding military security issues, it is essential to first establish a legislative definition of military cooperation.

It is proposed to include a clearly defined concept of international military cooperation in the list of key terms in Article 1 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Defense and the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan". Furthermore, it is recommended to amend Article 32, the final section of this Law, by adding a subparagraph outlining the main areas of international military cooperation.

As a result, this article emphasizes the importance of thoroughly addressing the legal regulation of military cooperation amid its rapid development. The need for a unified legal document in this field is highlighted, and the necessity of legislatively defining the concept of military cooperation and enshrining it in the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan is substantiated. This represents the scientific novelty of the research.

Today, numerous international organizations have been established and are operational worldwide. Among the international organizations in which the Republic of Kazakhstan is an active member, fostering mutual cooperation, are the United Nations (UN), the World Trade Organization (WTO), the Organization of Turkic States (OTS), the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), the Collective Security Treaty Organization (CSTO), the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO), the Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia (CICA), the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), the Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU), and TURKSOY.

In the military domain, Kazakhstan participates in several key regional military-political organizations, particularly within the Commonwealth of Independent States framework. These include the CSTO, SCO, CICA, and OSCE. Notably, in 2024, Kazakhstan assumed the chairmanship of both the CSTO and SCO, granting the country valuable opportunities to enhance its role in international security and defense coopera-

tion. This demonstrates Kazakhstan's readiness, along with other states, to implement the most effective measures in the field of security.

The importance of global military security necessitates a reassessment of the directions and priorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan's military policy. It also calls for concrete steps and amendments to be made in the relevant legal documents in this sphere. In this context, in 2022, President Kassym-Jomart Kemelovich Tokayev introduced a series of amendments to Kazakhstan's Military Doctrine, focusing particularly on aspects of international cooperation. These revisions started with modifications to the Presidential Decree of the Republic of Kazakhstan, dated September 29, 2017, No. 554, titled "On Approving the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan." The amendments highlight the particular emphasis on strengthening international cooperation and partnerships with other states and international organizations as a key element of ensuring Kazakhstan's military security. This demonstrates the ongoing development and enhancement of Kazakhstan's international military cooperation [4].

In the field of military cooperation, since gaining independence, the Republic of Kazakhstan has established military cooperation with over 50 countries worldwide. The emphasis is placed on nations with significant military defense capabilities and expertise, including the United States, Russia, China, Turkey, countries within the CIS, European nations, as well as regions in South Asia and the Middle East [5]. Within the context of bilateral relations, several key priorities have been outlined: peacekeeping efforts, the improvement of military training through the organization of diverse drills and exercises, military education, and military-technical cooperation.

In accordance with the directions of military policy, the military cooperation organized on this basis aims to accomplish the following tasks in the organization of military service in each country: the identification of key opportunities for ensuring military security; the development and justification of military-political decisions; the development of the country's military system; the organization of informational work; the accomplishment of tasks related to building the country's military potential (regulating military service, improving the qualifications of military personnel, etc.).

The activities of military personnel, both in individual states and in countries participating in any form of cooperation, are directly linked to the resolution of these tasks. For their effective and real implementation, relations between states are realized through the organization of various planned and regular joint training exercises, mutual exchange of experience among military personnel, training sessions, and other essential measures.

Kazakhstan's international military cooperation, as well as its accession to international documents in the field of security, reflects the commonality of military policies and political positions between states, as well as alignment with the ongoing military reforms [6; 30].

#### Discussion

Recent global events suggest that maintaining diplomatic relations with neighboring countries and upholding the rule of law and democratic governance within national borders — while vital for preserving sovereignty — do not alone suffice to ensure comprehensive security. To obtain guarantees for the comprehensive provision of military security, countries join or become part of regional or global international organizations, seeking mutual friendship, assistance, and peaceful coexistence. In this regard, the position of states requiring security, their policies, and the demonstrated political will are of paramount importance.

Considering the nation's long-term strategic priorities, Kazakhstan's key objectives in international cooperation encompass a wide range of areas, including politics, trade and economic ties, humanitarian efforts, as well as security and addressing new and emerging threats. These objectives focus not only on deepening connections with neighboring border states but also on broadening engagements with distant nations, including the United States, the European Union, and the member states of the Commonwealth of Independent States. Additionally, the development of bilateral and multilateral alliance relations forms the key priorities of Kazakhstan's foreign policy [7].

To date, the Republic of Kazakhstan has established diplomatic relations with many countries, joined a number of international agreements in various fields, and continues its efforts to gain membership in specialized international organizations in the areas of human rights, culture, education, economy, and defense. The legal basis for such membership in international organizations and cooperation with states in the field of military security stems from the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan [2], the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan [3], and the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On defense and the armed forces" [8].

The Military Doctrine outlines Kazakhstan's approach to military security, which is centered on three key priorities: first, ensuring internal stability within the state; second, preventing military threats while increasing participation in global security efforts; and third, maintaining a high state of readiness for the defense of Kazakhstan and its allied nations with which cooperative relations have been established [3].

This vision is based on the principle of respecting international legal norms and principles, enshrined in the country's Constitution as a rule-of-law state, as well as the importance of establishing relationships between states based on cooperation and good-neighborliness. Thus, it is clear that addressing any politically important issues in Kazakhstan, and translating them into practical action, must primarily be grounded in a strong legal foundation, ensuring that these efforts safeguard the nation's sovereignty and promote the well-being of its citizens. Any subsequent international cooperation must primarily serve the interests of the state — a peaceful existence. Additionally, this stance is grounded in the obligation specified in paragraph 3 of Article 2 of the UN Charter, which asserts that "All Members shall resolve their international disputes through peaceful means in such a way that international peace and security, and justice, are not put at risk" [9]. However, this does not suggest that states should avoid collaborating with one another in military security matters to protect against external threats.

Every cooperation agreement between the parties outlines specific issues and commitments, detailing the structure, the goals to be achieved, the challenges to be addressed, and the responsibilities each party is obligated to uphold. On one hand, military security encompasses content aimed at preventing potential future threats, conducting joint military exercises, and providing assistance in defense matters. On the other hand, it manifests in the ability of states to withdraw from fulfilling certain commitments under other agreements if such commitments contradict the sovereignty of the country, its security, internal policy, or interests. This principle was reflected in the Cooperation Agreement between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the European Communities and their member states, signed in 1995 [10]. Thus, military security is manifested not only through tangible measures but also through acts of protest — specifically, the deliberate non-fulfillment of obligations that run counter to national interests.

To confirm the above, Article 2 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On International Treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan" can be referenced. According to this provision, the conclusion of any international treaty that does not align with the national interests of the Republic of Kazakhstan or that threatens its national security is deemed unacceptable at the legislative level [11].

The data presented above confirm the voluntary nature of Kazakhstan's or other states' decisions based on their sovereignty and independence. Therefore, in Kazakhstan's international relations, first, the protection of the country's interests is ensured, and second, it is legally established that such actions do not violate any agreements in terms of prioritizing national interests.

The Republic of Kazakhstan established considerable influence in global politics and is recognized as a key player in maintaining international security. In the military realm, Kazakhstan is an active member of several regional military-political organizations, including the Collective Security Treaty Organization (CSTO) within the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO), the Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia (CICA), and the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE).

Researchers' views on the multifaceted nature of Kazakhstan's military cooperation with countries around the world vary considerably.

According to M.V. Danilovich, military cooperation among states within the Shanghai Cooperation Organization (SCO) has become a crucial tool in ensuring the territorial integrity of states, as well as in combating illegal occupation, terrorism, and extremism [12; 56].

Another Russian analyst, A.F. Klimenko, suggests enhancing "consultative mechanisms to promote conflict resolution in the territories of the member states" within the framework of the SCO [13; 27].

We believe that the opinions outlined above are not exclusive to regional organizations of international cooperation, such as the SCO. These approaches should be characteristic of all organizations engaged in military cooperation. This is due to the fact that the military policies of states, military-scientific technologies, and the forms and nature of threats are constantly evolving. Therefore, participation in such alliances should be grounded in a shared interest — even if partial — in harmonizing the military policies of member states.

The military doctrines adopted in the post-Soviet states reflect priority areas of military policy, which differ significantly in scope and strategic orientation. This is a natural phenomenon. However, we maintain the view that the effectiveness of state cooperation in the military sphere, aimed at achieving a common objective, is directly contingent on the degree of similarity between these areas.

The authors argue that effective coordination and unification of the various directions in military policy require mutual cooperation between states, as well as the establishment of a consultative and coordinating body within international organizations.

In the military relations between states, the primary focus and subject of agreements should center on concepts such as "security", "military cooperation", and "joint military training". Despite each state forming its own military policy, none can independently ensure its security or develop without cooperation with other nations.

The core concept here is security, which V.M. Kulagin defines as follows: in a broad sense, security is the state of being protected from threats, meaning it is determined depending on the scale of the emerging danger. To ensure security, countries achieve this through cooperation with their partners [14; 8]. This definition is well-received as it aligns with the views of the authors and widely accepted principles of the security concept. The state of protection is maintained by states at the national, regional, and global levels, depending on the scale of the threat. Since security in the modern world has acquired new characteristics that did not previously exist, various preventive measures are adopted depending on their scope, nature, and type.

According to Russian researcher O.P. Chazov, Kazakhstan is interested in military-political integration with Russia to ensure its national security [15]. Russia, in turn, benefits from this cooperation by receiving a "security belt" against threats originating from the southern borders, as he notes.

Nevertheless, it is important to note that the successful implementation of cooperation in this area is hindered by obstacles such as differences in national legislations and the uneven level of military-technical capabilities across countries. A similar viewpoint is expressed by Russian scholar O.N. Zenchukova. According to her, military-technical cooperation is not merely a process, but a historical reality. She identifies key issues such as the lag in the defense industry, insufficient funding, and the annual obsolescence of military equipment [16].

Russian scholar I.V. Ignatyeva holds the view that the security of one state is directly linked to the security of the global community. This is due to the multifaceted nature of security. The increasing interdependence gives rise to security issues at both the regional and international levels. In her opinion, the alignment of national interests among states should become the core of the concept of regional and international security [17; 86].

Military security and international cooperation must remain ongoing priorities on the agenda. To ensure their effectiveness, proper coordination of state actions and harmonization of national legislation are essential. These measures are crucial for aligning military activities with contemporary requirements and ensuring their high effectiveness. Therefore, a necessary first step is the harmonization of national legislation. Additionally, when drafting agreements and concepts that include shared rights and obligations, all potential factors must be taken into account. Such provisions should be enshrined starting from the Constitution of the respective state, as well as in military doctrines and laws that regulate military service.

In recent years, Kazakhstan's military cooperation has seen significant growth, extending beyond the CIS member states to include stronger ties with the Republic of Turkey. Each cooperation agreement is designed to collaboratively address security concerns, align on shared objectives, and foster coordination and advancement of military services between the countries involved. Kazakhstan's international military cooperation is focused on several key priority areas. With the Russian Federation, the emphasis is on military training, education, and enhancing the bilateral legal framework, among other aspects [18]. In collaboration with the United States, the priorities include training military personnel and engaging in peacekeeping operations to bolster regional security [19]. With Turkey, the scope of cooperation covers military personnel training, advisory support, reciprocal visits for training purposes, experience-sharing, joint exercises, the development of military legislation, participation in peacekeeping missions, military-scientific research, human rights exchanges, and social assistance for military personnel, among other initiatives [20]. Although this agreement was concluded relatively recently, the broad range of tasks outlined in its text today is reflected in the annually approved military cooperation plan between Kazakhstan and Turkey [21]. In accordance with this annual plan, measures are implemented to enhance the military service's potential through military education, peacekeeping missions, and military training activities.

#### Conclusions

Managing relations with other nations is a central aspect of every state's foreign policy. In ensuring cooperation, a normative and legal framework is formed and developed. In the military sphere, an extensive treaty and legal framework has been created for cooperation with foreign states and international organizations.

To ensure effective and result-oriented international cooperation in the military domain, particularly in securing the military defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it is essential to pursue a coordinated integration of efforts under shared strategic objectives. This requires the alignment of specific actions among participating states and the comprehensive development of a legal framework that governs military collaboration. Such a framework must be oriented toward establishing a robust and reliable defense infrastructure.

The conducted research revealed several systemic challenges in the legal regulation of the international military cooperation related to national security. Based on these findings, the study presents the following conclusions:

- To establish an effective system of collective security, it is essential to adopt a legally binding concept of military cooperation. In the absence of such a framework, the practical capacities of states to engage in military collaboration remain significantly constrained. A clearly defined concept, once institutionalized as a foundational element of national defense policy, would serve to deepen and expand the substantive dimensions of interstate military cooperation.
- National legal systems governing military affairs differ substantially in both scope and structure, as they reflect distinct domestic policy priorities and strategic traditions. To overcome these disparities, it is essential to activate an efficient consultative mechanism. This mechanism must be capable of coordinating the legal frameworks of member states within a military alliance. Furthermore, it is imperative to introduce regular revisions to the legal instruments and agreements that regulate legislative harmonization, ensuring that they evolve in accordance with current geopolitical and security demands.
- The analysis of legal frameworks governing military cooperation has underscored the urgent need for a unified terminological reference system. Clearly defined and legally codified terms, comprehensible and consistent across jurisdictions, are essential to eliminating ambiguities in the interpretation and application of regulatory standards.
- The Military Doctrine reflects the state's position on defense policy, but it does not have the force of law. Therefore, it is important to include a clear definition of international military cooperation in Article 1 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Defense and the Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan". In addition, Article 32 should be supplemented with provisions that set out the main areas of such cooperation.

The findings obtained through this research confirm its scholarly significance. They provide a conceptual basis for further in-depth theoretical inquiry into the legal dimensions of interstate cooperation in the military domain. These results not only reflect the current state of regulatory challenges but also outline key vectors for advancing the normative development of international defense partnerships.

The scientific conclusions and propositions formulated throughout this research possess clear practical relevance. They may be employed by policymakers and legislators in shaping national defense strategies, enhancing military security, and advancing the development of international military cooperation. Moreover, these findings are applicable in the legal regulation of service-related activities of military personnel, thereby contributing to the refinement of institutional and normative mechanisms in the defense sector.

## Acknowledgements

"Research was funded by Science Committee of Ministry of Education and Science of Republic of Kazakhstan (Grant No. AP22686829)"

#### References

- 1 О государственной независимости Республики Казахстан. Конституционный закон Республики Казахстан от 16 декабря 1991 года. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z910004400
- 2 Конституция Республики Казахстан от 30 августа 1995 г. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K950001000\_
- 3 Об утверждении Военной доктрины Республики Казахстан. Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 29 сентября 2017 года № 554. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U1700000554

- 4 Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 12 октября 2022 года № 1045. О внесении изменений и дополнений в Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 29 сентября 2017 года № 554 «Об утверждении Военной доктрины Республики Казахстан». [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2200001045
- 5 С момента обретения независимости Казахстан установил военное сотрудничество с более 50 государствами мира. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://archive.sarbaz.kz/country/s-momenta-obreteniya-nezavisimosti-kazahstan-ustanovil-voennoe-sotrudnichestvo-s-bolee-chem-50-gosudarstvami-mira-17681004/? sphrase\_id=4332333.
- 6 Мусин Қ.С. Қазақстан Республикасы әскери саясатын конституциялық құқықтық реттеу / Қ.С. Мусин // Қарағанды университетінің хабаршысы. Құқық сериясы. 2014. № 1(73). Б. 28–35.
- 7 О Концепции внешней политики Республики Казахстан на 2020-2030 годы. Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 6 марта 2020 года № 280. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000280
- 8 Об обороне и Вооруженных Силах Республики Казахстан. Закон Республики Казахстан от 7 января 2005 года № 29. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z050000029
  - 9 Устав ООН. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://www.un.org/ru/about-us/un-charter/full-text
- 10 О ратификации Соглашения о партнерстве и сотрудничестве между Республикой Казахстан, с одной стороны, и Европейскими Сообществами и их Государствами членами, с другой стороны Закон Республики Казахстан от 26 мая 1997 г. № 113-І. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000280
- 11 О международных договорах Республики Казахстан. Закон Республики Казахстан от 30 мая 2005 года № 54. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z050000054
- 12 Данилович М.В. Шанхайская организация сотрудничества и проблемы безопасности Евразии [Электронный ресурс] / М.В. Данилович, А.А. Розанова. Минск: БГУ, 2012. 194 с. Режим доступа: https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/ShOS\_final.pdf
- 13 Клименко А.Ф. Проблемы региональной безопасности и некоторые пути ее решения при реализации стратегии развития Шанхайской Организации Сотрудничества до 2025 года / А.Ф. Клименко // Проблемы обеспечения безопасности на пространстве ШОС. М.: Издательство «Весь мир», С. 27–44
  - 14 Кулагин В.М. Международная безопасность / В.М. Кулагин. М.: Аспект Пресс, 2007. 24 с.
- 15 Чазов О.П. Государственная политика Российской Федерации по совершенствованию военно-политической интеграции с Республикой Казахстан: автореф. дис. ... канд. полит. наук: спец. 23.00.02. «Политические институты, процессы и технологии» / О.П. Чазов. Москва, 2013. 23 с.
- 16 Зенчукова О.Н. Актуальные проблемы военно-технического сотрудничества / О.Н. Зенчукова // Власть. 2012. № 6. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/aktualnye-problemy-voenno-tehnicheskogo-sotrudnichestva.
- 17 Игнатьева И.В. Международная безопасность и актуальные проблемы ее обеспечения / И.В. Игнатьева // ГлаголЪ правосудия. 2017. № 2(14). С. 86–92.
- 18 О подписании Договора между Республикой Казахстан и Российской Федерацией о военном сотрудничестве Указ Президента Республики Казахстан от 16 октября 2020 года № 438. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000438
- 19 Международное военное сотрудничество в области обороны и безопасности. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://archive.sarbaz.kz/analytics/megdunarodnoe-voennoe-sotrudnichestvo-v-oblasti-oborony-i-bezopasnosti-211270803/? sphrase id=5151688
- 20 О ратификации Соглашения между Правительством Республики Казахстан и Правительством Турецкой Республики о военном сотрудничестве. Закон Республики Казахстан от 20 декабря 2019 года № 281-VI ЗРК. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z1900000281
- 21 Казахстан и Турция утвердил план военного сотрудничества на 2025 год. [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://kaztag.kz/ru/news/kazakhstan-i-turtsiya-utverdili-plan-voennogo-sotrudnichestva-na-2025-god

# Р.Б. Ботагарин, К.С. Мусин

# Қазақстан Республикасының шет мемлекеттермен әскери саладағы ынтымақтастығының құқықтық негіздері: әскери саясат және қызмет сұрақтары

Мақалада Қазақстан Республикасының кейбір шет елдермен қазіргі таңдағы әскери саласының ынтымақтастығы, әскери саясатының бағыттары, әскери қауіпсіздікті қамтамасыз етудегі әскери қызметті құқықтық қамтамасыз ету сұрақтары қарастырылған. Авторлардың пікірінше, кейінгі уақыттары әлемдегі әскери-саяси тұрақсыздық салдарынан туындайтын жағымсыз салдарлардың алдын алудың басты шарты — әскери саладағы ынтымақтастықты жалғастыру. Зерттеу барысында еліміздің тәуелсіздігі жылдарынан бергі әскери қауіпсіздікті қамтамасыз етудегі атқарылған шаралар, жасалған келісімшарттар, мемлекеттің әскери саясатының негізін құрайтын құқықтық құжаттар, әскери қызмет бағыттарының ерекшеліктері зерделенген. Зерттеудің мақсаты Қазақстан

Республикасының әскери саладағы халықаралық ұйымдармен және Түркия Республикасы мен Ресей Федерациясымен ынтымақтастығының құқықтық негізін және құқықтық реттеу сұрақтарын, сонымен қатар басқа да әскери ынтымақтастық аясында атқарылып келген шаралардың ел қауіпсіздігін қамтамасыз етудегі тиімділігі дәрежесін анықтаудан тұрады. Зерттеу жұмыстары кезінде әскери салада жасалған келісім шарттарға құқықтық талдау жүргізу, салыстырмалы-құқықтық әдістері қолданылды. Зерттеудің нормативтік негізін Қазақстан Республикасының Конституциясы, Қазақстан Республикасының әскери доктриналары, Қазақстан мен Түркия республикаларының арасындағы әскери ынтымақтастық туралы келісімдер, әскери ынтымақтастық жоспарлар мен өзге де әскери ынтымақтастыққа аясындағы құқықтық құжаттар құрайды. Авторлар көрші елдермен бейбіт өмір сүруді қамтамасыз ету үшін әскери ынтымақтастық орнату елдің әскери қауіпсіздігін қамтамасыз етудегі кез келген мемлекеттің аса маңызды қызметтерінің бірі деген қорытындыға келді. Сонымен қатар, әскери салада тәжірибе алмасу үшін әскери қызмет саласындағы құқықтық базаны жетілдіру бойынша ұсыныстар жасалады.

*Кілт сөздер:* Қазақстан Республикасы, Түркия Республикасы, әскери қауіпсіздік, Конституция, әскери докторина, әскери саясат, әскери қызмет, келісім шарт, ынтымақтастық, құқықтық қамтамасыз ету.

## Р.Б. Ботагарин, К.С. Мусин

# Правовые основы сотрудничества Республики Казахстан с зарубежными странами в военной сфере: вопросы военной политики и службы

В статье рассмотрены вопросы сотрудничества Республики Казахстан с некоторыми зарубежными странами в современной военной сфере, направления военной политики, правового обеспечения воинской службы в обеспечении военной безопасности. По мнению авторов, главным условием предотвращения негативных последствий, возникающих в результате военно-политической нестабильности в мире, является продолжение сотрудничества в военной сфере. В ходе исследования будут рассмотрены предпринятые меры по обеспечению военной безопасности за годы независимости страны, заключенные договоры, правовые документы, составляющие основу военной политики государства, особенности направлений военной службы. Цель исследования состоит в определении правовой основы и вопросов правового регулирования сотрудничества Республики Казахстан с международными организациями военной сферы и Турецкой Республикой и Российской Федерацией, а также степени эффективности мероприятий, проводимых в рамках других видов военного сотрудничества, в обеспечении безопасности страны. В ходе исследовательской работы применялись сравнительно-правовые методы проведения правового анализа договоров, заключенных в военной сфере. Нормативную основу исследования составили Конституция Республики Казахстан, военные доктрины Республики Казахстан, соглашения о военном сотрудничестве между казахстанскими и турецкими республиками, планы военного сотрудничества и иные правовые документы в рамках военного сотрудничества. Авторы пришли к выводу, что установление военного сотрудничества с соседними странами для обеспечения мирного сосуществования является одной из важнейших функций любого государства в обеспечении военной безопасности страны. Кроме того, будут даны рекомендации по совершенствованию правовой базы в сфере воинской службы для обмена опытом в военной сфере.

*Ключевые слова:* Республика Казахстан, Турецкая Республика, военная безопасность, Конституция, военная доктрина, военная политика, военная служба, соглашение, сотрудничество, правовое обеспечение.

#### References

- 1 O gosudarstvennoi nezavisimosti Respubliki Kazakhstan. Konstitutsionnyi zakon Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 16 dekabria 1991 goda [On the state independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Constitutional Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z910004400 [in Russian].
- 2 Konstitutsia Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 30 avgusta 1995 g. [Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 30, 1995]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K950001000\_ [in Russian].
- 3 Ob utverzhdenii Voennoi doktriny Respubliki Kazakhstan. Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 29 sentiabria 2017 goda № 554 [On the approval of the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan] *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U1700000554 [in Russian].
- 4 O vnesenii izmenenii i dopolnenii v Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 29 sentiabria 2017 goda № 554 "Ob utverzhdenii Voennoi doktriny Respubliki Kazakhstan" Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 12 oktiabria 2022 goda № 1045. [Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. On approval of the Military Doctrine of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. adilet.zan.kz. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2200001045 [in Russian].
- 5 S momenta obreteniia nezavisimosti Kazakhstan ustanovil voennoe sotrudnichestvo s bolee 50 gosudarstvami mira [Since gaining independence, Kazakhstan has established military cooperation with more than 50 countries around the world].

archive.sarbaz.kz. Retrieved from <a href="https://archive.sarbaz.kz/country/s-momenta-obreteniya-nezavisimosti-kazahstan-ustanovil-voennoe-sotrudnichestvo-s-bolee-chem-50-gosudarstvami-mira-17681004/? sphrase id=4332333 [in Russian].</a>

- 6 Musin, K.S. (2014). Qazaqstan Respublikasy askeri saiasatyn konstitutsiialyq quqyqtyq retteu [Constitutional Legal Regulation of the policy of the army of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *Qaragandy universitetinin khabarshysy. Quqyq seriasy Bulettin of the Karaganda university. Law series, 1, 28-35* [in Kazakh].
- 7 O Kontseptsii vneshnei politiki Respubliki Kazakhstan na 2020–2030 gody. Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 6 marta 2020 goda № 280 [On the Concept of the Foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2030. Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000280 [in Russian].
- 8 Ob oborone i Vooruzhennykh Silakh Respubliki Kazakhstan. Zakon Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 7 yanvaria 2005 goda № 29 [About the Defense and Armed Forces of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z050000029 [in Russian].
  - 9 Ustav OON [The UN Charter]. un.org. Retrieved from https://www.un.org/ru/about-us/un-charter/full-text [in Russian].
- 10 O ratifikatsii Soglasheniia o partnerstve i sotrudnichestve mezhdu Respublikoi Kazakhstan, s odnoi storony, i Evropeiskimi Soobshchestvami i ikh Gosudarstvami chlenami, s drugoi storony Zakon Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 26 maia 1997 g. № 113-I [On the ratification of the Partnership and Cooperation Agreement between the Republic of Kazakhstan, on the one hand, and the European Communities and their Member States, on the other hand, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 26, 1997 No. 113-I]. adilet.zan.kz. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000280 [in Russian].
- 11 O mezhdunarodnykh dogovorakh Respubliki Kazakhstan. Zakon Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 30 maia 2005 goda № 54 [On international treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z050000054 [in Russian].
- 12 Danilovich, M.V., & Rozanova, A.A. (2012). Shankhaiskaia organizatsiia sotrudnichestva i problemy bezopasnosti Evrazii [The Shanghai Cooperation Organization and Eurasian security issues]. Minsk: BGU. <u>dcaf.ch</u>. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/ShOS final.pdf">https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/ShOS final.pdf</a> [in Russian].
- 13 Klimenko, A.F. (2017). Problemy regionalnoi bezopasnosti i nekotorye puti ee resheniia pri realizatsii strategii razvitiia Shankhaiskoi Organizatsii Sotrudnichestva do 2025 goda [Problems of regional security and some ways to solve it in the implementation of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization development strategy until 2025]. *Problemy obespecheniia bezopasnosti na prostranstve ShOS Security issues in the SCO space*, 27–44 [in Russian].
  - 14 Kulagin, V.M. (2007). Mezhdunarodnaia bezopasnost [International security]. Moskva: Aspekt Press [in Russian].
- 15 Chazov, O.P. (2013). Gosudarstvennaia politika Rossiiskoi Federatsii po sovershenstvovaniiu voenno-politicheskoi integratsii s Respublikoi Kazakhstan [The State policy of the Russian Federation on improving military-political integration with the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *Extended abstract of Doctor's thesis*. Moscow [in Russian].
- 16 Zenchukova, O.N. (2012). Aktualnye problemy voenno-tekhnicheskogo sotrudnichestva [Actual problems of military-technical cooperation]. *Vlast Power, 6,* 35–38. Retrieved from https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/aktualnye-problemy-voenno-tehnicheskogo-sotrudnichestva [in Russian].
- 17 Ignatyeyva, I.V. (2017). Mezhdunarodnaia bezopasnost i aktualnye problemy ee obespecheniia [International security and current problems of its provision]. *Glagol pravosudiia The verb of justice, 2, 86–92*. [in Russian].
- 18 O podpisanii Dogovora mezhdu Respublikoi Kazakhstan i Rossiiskoi Federatsiei o voennom sotrudnichestve Ukaz Prezidenta Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 16 oktiabria 2020 goda № 438 [Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 16, 2020 No. 438 on the signing of the Agreement between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation on Military Cooperation]. adilet.zan.kz. Retrieved from <a href="https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000438">https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U2000000438</a> [in Russian].
- 19 Mezhdunarodnoe voennoe sotrudnichestvo v oblasti oborony i bezopasnosti [International military cooperation in the field of defense and security]. archive.sarbaz.kz. Retrieved from <a href="https://archive.sarbaz.kz/analytics/megdunarodnoe-voennoe-sotrudnichestvo-v-oblasti-oborony-i-bezopasnosti-211270803/? sphrase id=5151688">https://archive.sarbaz.kz/analytics/megdunarodnoe-voennoe-sotrudnichestvo-v-oblasti-oborony-i-bezopasnosti-211270803/? sphrase id=5151688</a> [in Russian].
- 20 O ratifikatsii Soglasheniia mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Kazakhstan i Pravitelstvom Turetskoi Respubliki o voennom sotrudnichestve. Zakon Respubliki Kazakhstan ot 20 dekabria 2019 goda № 281-VI ZRK [On the ratification of the Agreement between the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Turkey on Military Cooperation. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. *adilet.zan.kz*. Retrieved from <a href="https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z1900000281">https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/Z1900000281</a> [in Russian].
- 21 Kazakhstan i Turtsiia utverdil plan voennogo sotrudnichestva na 2025 god [Kazakhstan and Turkey have approved a military cooperation plan for 2025]. *kaztag.kz*. Retrieved from <a href="https://kaztag.kz/ru/news/kazakhstan-i-turtsiya-utverdili-plan-voennogo-sotrudnichestva-na-2025-god">https://kaztag.kz/ru/news/kazakhstan-i-turtsiya-utverdili-plan-voennogo-sotrudnichestva-na-2025-god</a> [in Russian].

#### Information about the authors

**Botagarin Ruslan Bakytuly** — PhD, Associate Professor at the Department of Constitutional and International Law, Karaganda Buketov University, Karaganda, Kazakhstan; e-mail: <a href="mailto:botagarin ruslan@mail.ru">botagarin ruslan@mail.ru</a>

Mussin Kuat Saniyazdanovich — PhD, Associate Professor at the Head of the Department of Constitutional and International Law, Karaganda Buketov University, Karaganda, Kazakhstan; e-mail: mkuat80@mail.ru